

Proceedings of the 34th World Congress of Art History

第 34 届世界艺术史 大会文集

全三卷
Vols. I-III

邵大箴 范迪安 朱青生 主编

Shao Dazhen / Fan Di'an / LaoZhu

《第34届世界艺术史大会文集》(全三卷)电子版的最终解释权归商务印书馆所有。未经商务印书馆书面授权,不得以任何方式加以使用,包括转载、摘编、复制或建立镜像。商务印书馆保留追究侵权者法律责任的权利。

The Commercial Press reserves the right of final interpretation of the electronic version of *Proceedings of the 34th World Congress of Art History* (Vols. I–III). Without permission, it is not allowed to use this version by any means, including reprinting, excerpting or reproducing.

TERMS

概 念

不同历史和不同文化中的艺术和艺术史

Proceedings of the 34th World Congress of
Art History

第 34 届世界艺术史 大会文集

第一卷
Vol. I

邵大箴 范迪安 朱青生 主编

Shao Dazhen / Fan Di'an / LaoZhu

 商务印书馆
The Commercial Press

2019年·北京

图书在版编目(CIP)数据

第34届世界艺术史大会文集(全三卷)/邵大箴,范迪安,朱青生主编.—北京:商务印书馆,2019

ISBN 978-7-100-17720-7

I. ①第… II. ①邵… ②范… ③朱… III. ①艺术史—世界—学术会议—文集 IV. ①J110.9-53

中国版本图书馆CIP数据核字(2019)第152754号

权利保留,侵权必究。

第34届世界艺术史大会文集
(全三卷)

邵大箴 范迪安 朱青生 主编

商务印书馆出版

(北京王府井大街36号 邮政编码 100710)

商务印书馆发行

山东临沂新华印刷物流

集团有限责任公司印刷

ISBN 978-7-100-17720-7

2019年12月第1版 开本 640×960 1/16

2019年12月第1次印刷 印张 146%

定价: 1680.00元

第34届世界艺术史大会
The 34th World Congress of Art History

北京·Beijing
2016年9月16日—20日

主办单位

国际艺术史学会 (CIHA)
中央美术学院
北京大学

协办单位

故宫博物院
吴作人国际美术基金会

合作单位

中国美术家协会、中国美术学院、中国国家画院
北京林业大学、青州市博物馆、美国高校艺术联盟

资助单位

美国盖蒂基金会
中植企业集团有限公司
北京欧力普公共艺术设计股份有限公司
北京颂雅风文化传媒有限责任公司
欧阳泥彩工作室

ORGANIZERS

Comité International d'Histoire de l'Art (CIHA)
Central Academy of Fine Arts
Peking University

CO-ORGANIZERS

The Palace Museum
Wu Zuoren International Foundation of Fine Arts

COOPERATION

China Artist Association, China Academy of Art, China National Academy of Painting,
Beijing Forestry University, Qingzhou Municipal Museum, College Art Association (CAA)

SPONSORS

The Getty Foundation
Zhongzhi Enterprise Group
Beijing OLP Public Art Design Co. Ltd.
Beijing Song Ya Feng Culture Media Limited Liability Company
OY · Vivid Clay Sculpture Studio

- | | | |
|------|--------------------|---|
| | Chang Sheng-Ching | The Enlightenment of Prussia Through the Far East: From the Planning of the Gardens of Potsdam to Modern Cityscape Planning |
| 1318 | 伊琳娜·赫梅列夫斯基赫 | 从马利花园到彼德罗夫：俄罗斯如何接纳一所法国花园的设计 |
| | Irina Khmelevskikh | From Marly Gardens to Peterhof: How a French Garden Design Was Adapted to Russia |
| 1322 | 布丽吉特·艾诺 | 中国和18世纪老低地国家的盎格鲁-中国风园林：影响与异同 |
| | Brigitte D'Hainaut | Chinese and Anglo-Chinese Gardens from the Old Low Countries (18th Century): Influences, Similarities, Differences |
| 1328 | 杜 娟 | 王世贞在弇山园中的书画交游研究 |
| | Du Juan | Elegant Gathering and Art Collecting in Wang Shizhen's Yanshan Garden |
| 1354 | 李啸非 | 乡绅的桃花源：《环翠堂园景图》与晚明出版业中的图像消费 |
| | Li Xiaofei | A Merchant' Arcadia: <i>Huancui Tang Yuanjing Tu</i> and the Consumed Images in Publishing in the Late Ming |
| 1364 | 文以诚 | 逾墙的视线：17世纪园林文化中的视像与虚构 |
| | Richard Vinograd | Looking over the Garden Wall: Visions and Fictions in 17th-Century Garden Culture |
| 1373 | 刘 冠 | 在场与当时：明清江南园林的艺术特质 |
| | Liu Guan | There-Then: The Artistic Nature of Jiangnan Garden in the Ming and Qing Dynasties |

第 13 分会：传播与接受 Session 13: Transmission and Adoption

- | | | |
|------|---------------|----------------------------|
| 1381 | 井手诚之辅 | 第13分会综述 |
| | Seinosuke Ide | Introduction to Session 13 |
| 1384 | 刘 晨 | 第13分会综述 |

- | | | |
|------|------------------|--|
| | Liu Chen | Introduction to Session 13 |
| 1387 | 张书彬 | 神圣导引与视觉朝圣：敦煌莫高窟第61窟《五台山图》的时空逻辑 |
| | Zhang Shubin | Divine Guidance and Visual Pilgrimage: The Tempo-Spatial Logic of the <i>Panoramic Mural Map of Mt. Wutai</i> in Dunhuang Mogao Cave 61 |
| 1397 | 萨连纳·阿卜杜拉 | 马来西亚艺术的早期（视觉）现代性：扩大叙事 |
| | Sarena Abdullah | Early (Visual) Modernity in Malaysian Art: Expanding the Narrative |
| 1402 | 罗穆亚尔德·齐博佐 | 欧洲艺术技巧在非洲的传播和采纳过程：对美学实践的影响？ |
| | Romuald Tchibozo | Process of Transmission and Adoption of the Techniques of European Art in Africa: What Impact on Aesthetic Practices? |
| 1410 | 陈艺婕 | 20世纪初日本的中国美术研究及其回应——以内藤湖南与芥川龙之介对中国文人画的想法为例 |
| | Chen Yijie | Chinese Art History Research in Japan and Its Reception in 1920s: Illustrated by the Case of Naito Konan and Akutagawa Ryunosuke's Literati Painting |
| 1419 | 田中健一 | 鉴真在日本的艺术传播与接受 |
| | Ken'ichi Tanaka | Jianzhen's Transmission of Art and Adoption in Japan |
| 1424 | 里卡尔多·文图里 | 曼谷的瓦萨里，或现代艺术如何来到东南亚：以科拉多·费罗奇为例 |
| | Riccardo Venturi | Vasari in Bangkok, or Modern Art in South-East Asia: The Case of Corrado Feroci |
| 1432 | 孙美琳 | 背离中的继承——试析1939—1949年庞薰琹作品中的“现代”与“传统” |
| | Sun Meilin | Inheritance in Departure: Analysis of "Modern" and "Tradition" in Works of Pang Xunqin from 1939 to 1949 |
| 1443 | 东家友子 | 中日两国接受珂勒惠支艺术过程的比较分析 |
| | Tomoko Toya | First Reception of Käthe Kollwitz's Art in Japan and China: A Comparative Approach to the Introductory Texts by Koreya Senda and Lu Xun |

- 1452 范丽雅 透过“日本之眼”的中国画——试论劳伦斯·宾扬对中国画的理解与误解
- Fan Liya Chinese Painting Through “Japanese Eyes”: With Special Reference to Laurence Binyon’s Understanding and Misunderstanding of Chinese Painting
- 1461 维里厄·乔普拉 / 萨马·哈克 共时传播：从玉佛寺拉玛壁画说起
- Virien Chopra / Sama Haq Synchronic Transmission: A Look at the Ramakien Murals at Wat Phra Kaew in Thailand
- 1470 张 啸 / 杨得聆 无尽的艺术超链接——网络博物馆扩大艺术的文化后生产
- Zhang Xiao / Yang Deling Endless Art Hyperlinks: The Expanded Cultural Post-production of Art in Online Museums

第三卷 Vol. III

第 14 分会：他者与陌生 Session 14: Othering and Foreignness

- 1483 梁舒涵 第14分会综述
- Liang Shuhan Introduction to Session 14
- 1485 马里纳·维切利加 中世纪西欧艺术中的罪人和异教徒：伊斯特拉中的两个例子
- Marina Vicelja Depicting Sinners and Heretics as Others in Western European Medieval Art: Two Examples from Istria
- 1497 马利亚·贝尔巴拉 现代早期欧洲动物学中的他者：以犰狳为例
- Maria Barbara The Zoological Other in Early Modern Europe: The Case of the Armadillo
- 1505 儿岛由枝 澳门《大天使圣米迦勒持圣体匣》：远东—基督教画作之风格、图像志及其重要性研究
- Yoshie Kojima *St. Michael the Archangel Holding a Monstrance* in Macau: Style, Iconography, and Importance of a Christian Painting in the Far-East

Process of Transmission and Adoption of the Techniques of European Art in Africa: What Impact on Aesthetic Practices?

Romuald Tchibozo

University of Abomey-Calavi

Introduction

In the aftermath of colonization, Westerner, particularly European, after religion and education was in lack of original arguments for new civilizing missions in Africa. They however discovered a new privileged field, the one of culture and arts. It should be noted that, since the landing of European in the 15th century on most African's coast and the subsequent development of some artistic forms particularly, the famous "Afro-Portuguese ivories," artistic production on the continent has not ceased to occupy the minds with certainly, varying fortunes at various times and under various circumstances during its long presence in Europe that will be especially marked by the birth of the cabinets of curiosity.

Later, once the Interior lands conquered and divided between colonizing powers, European will realize, in a first time, with some astonishment all that the peoples of this continent produced, before, in a second time, abundantly have interest on it Tchibozo (2003, 2014) mentioned. The different actors, administrators, researchers, priests and military will, not only massively collecting everything they saw and which fell them under the hand, but still and especially, they seek to influence the production teaching artists how to achieve the pieces while taking into account their preference.¹

Then, scientific missions were dispatched on the whole continent to collect widely pieces. It was about to go to see the interesting places which in the past were famous and not yet explored and studied, where it remained important artifacts and of which they knew very little thing. This was the case of Dakar-Djibouti mission in 1931, one of the most famous as well as negatively and positively. Positively because it allowed not only to have today a serious piece's corpus about the Dogon of Mali, for example, but also a good and rich literature.² Negatively, because it has helped deprive the continent of its heritage and, under incredible conditions described by some authors as Dupuis (1999)³ like the heist.

Thus, in addition to different events referred to above, the English punitive expedition of 1897 in Benin City contributed to carry, in large quantities,

African art in Europe. Museums, including ethnographic museums will arise as a result of the cabinets of curiosity and will determine a way to present these arts for both ideological and economic purposes (Laude, 1968)⁴. These institutions become progressively important, such as the Museum of Trocadéro founded in Paris in 1876, which will be one of the important places of encounter between African art and avant-garde artists before being the subject of all speculation in the galleries and other auction's events. This permits to put forward the following reflection hypothesis: the presence of the African art in the museums generated the idea of the transmission of the techniques used in Europe in order to influence art practices on the continent. What were the consequences of this initiative on the artistic production in Africa?

The two phenomena, on the one hand, the collection of artworks found on the spot or taken away in Europe and, on the other hand, the attempt of orientation of the production that is followed rhythmically themselves all the history of cultural and artistic relations between Europe and Africa, which will be study in this paper.

The adopted methodology for this paper is multidisciplinary for several reasons. The first is bound to the fact that it is difficult to study the phenomenon while only using art historian tools that were not applied to the understanding of African artistic production at the time of the facts. The second is determined by the ethnography's omnipresence, not only for the explanation of artistic productions on the continent, but also and especially, for the anthropological orientation of the studies of these productions determined as ethnic and as exotic fact. Therefore, not to make resorts to the tools of this discipline would be an intellectual myopia. Finally, more than art history facts, these are history facts that took place during the colonization and, it is necessary to convene here the method in history to fix the events concisely and to analyze them.

I will therefore successively present, the presence of African art in Europe through the artistic situation at that time, the embodiment of the transmission of techniques in Africa and, finally, the impact on

aesthetic practices on the continent.

African art in workshops in Europe between the 19th and 20th century

To make better understand the ulterior development of the process of transmission of techniques in Africa, it would be useful to go back quickly to what was art in Europe especially, in confrontation with non-Western arts. It is therefore important here to stress briefly the situation of aesthetic practices in Europe during the late 19th and early 20th century whereas the art of the non-European societies, including African, was already massively present on the continent. We were still at the dawn of modernism where the academic requirements for the realization of the artworks had hard life. Artistic movements of revolts against this academicism are explicit for some time and artists were looking for others ways, including how to free themselves from these old artistic cannons which were, for most, from Renaissance and that obviously seem outdated compared to the evolution of society. Even Orientalism introduced in art and the compulsive organization of the *World fairs* in all major colonizers' countries⁵, had not significantly changed the deal. Quite on opposite, it exacerbated exoticism and therefore, had not been enough sufficient to calm the concerns of practitioners who seemed to go towards an obstruction of the sources of inspiration and creativeness, because it was not a real solution. It is whereas Eduard Manet, with his *Olympia*, sparked off controversy because it seemed to have broken with all the rules that governed, until this moment, aesthetic practices, including non-sublimation of the goddess's representation. The principle that, these are perceptions and own feelings of the artist that count, took now precedence over in the representation and reflected in artistic practices. Impressionists will very quickly have pawn on street and their daring, will cause birth of other movements that will inspire the arts from "elsewhere," including Africa, Southeast Asia, Australia and Oceania. Later, Jean-Louis Ferrier (2010) wrote this: "impressionism was [...] the first great pictorial movement to break with the 'noble topics' thought up while they were only generators of beauty."⁶ This allusion to the "noble topics" by Ferrier refers us to the treatment of the non-European arts and so, to those in Africa which were paradoxically abused while useful to the evolution of aesthetic practices in this context. Even scientific theories will interfere in determining the judgment on Africa, because while discussing the biological evolution of Darwin, Europe was in the euphoria of the first industrial revolution, the concept of progress following a single and continuous way. This concept defined in the order of the technique was immediately applied in the one of morals, of social life and above all, for art. Technical progress would be thus at the

origin of moral progress, development of "fine art" and the "belles lettres." Non-European civilizations were then classified according to their index of technicality and, for example, the arts were not considered as such, because at the sight of this reasoning, they could not produce any.

However, the influence of African arts on some artists could no longer be unnoticed and so this evidence that sign the recognition of aesthetic value of the pieces brought back from Africa, as noted André Malraux (1996)⁷, by different artistic movements that found a freedom they sought to conquer will go as deep as surprising intellectual production. Among the few researchers and thinkers of this epoch who deal with this issue, I cannot ignore here, one of the first, Carl Einstein that, in 1915, published *Negerplastik*. This seminal work on African sculpture exclusively understood as aesthetic and classified as an art characterized by the preeminence of the volume provoked, as it was already the case for some artworks in 1906, polemics of researchers that is not, today, ready to turn off and you will allow me to not redo the story here⁸ (Fig. 1).

A little later, Frans Olbrechts (1959)⁹, nourished by the work of Einstein and those of Henri Lavachery (1930), and aware that it would be difficult to continue



Fig. 1 Kingdom Danxome sculptures at Trocadero in Paris. Extract from Gaëlle Beaujean-Baltzer

to study these pieces in seeking always to know what could have been their hypothetical function in their place of origin, invented a method of analysis of all the forms of the objects based on the concept of style as a relevant set of formal character. This encouraged the artists to thoroughly look at this art and so was born the concept of Primitivism in modern art. The technique of diversion which consist in disorientating an object of its primary function in art is back in vogue among many artists and particularly among those who have adopted materials used in Africa, including Antoni Tàpies, Anselme Kiefer and Miguel Barceló. I can also raise the late Arman cases, known for this by the extravagance of the expression of his work *Going with the Wind* carried out in 1995 which is a settlement in form of sheaf of Asen used in the culture of most of the populations of the South of Benin Republic to honor the memory of their ancestors or even Axel Cassel who integrated African statuaries in his pieces. The exhibition, *Primitivism in 20th Century Art: Affinity of the Tribal and the Modern* in 1984 gave an idea of the scale of the phenomenon.¹⁰ But then, how is that European art techniques were transmitted in Africa? What is exported to the Continent?

The tangibility of a transmission, development of the “schools”

At the beginning of the 20th century, artists in Africa were already faced to art market even if it was only a localized, reduced market, especially for colonial administrators and their auxiliaries. Indeed, to the surrender of most political entities organized on the continent, the colonizers had naturally become the new masters and are going to inherit the structural organization of the society let by the kings who became, for those of them even living and remained there¹¹, a simple local chief. Two events occurred at this time. The first, artistic production has lost its creativity, its requirements and above all, its dynamism because that the natural patron who was the king disappeared and the chain broken. The second is the intervention of the colonizers who are starting to ask the artists, who no longer know to what holy to vow themselves, to achieve the pieces according to their taste, a way to impose the redesign of existing artistic practices. These two phenomena are permanently impact the artistic production on the continent. It is important to note that, as in the 15th century, this collaboration will bring artists to produce important works, but also many others that not more corresponded to the initial approach.

In several regions on the African continent, these clerks of the colonial system will attempt to give a new direction to especially sculptural production, according to their own vision. Immediate consequence was the traditional themes are no longer the primary

concern of the sculptors even if the social relations network in which fits artistic production remained globally similar to the one precolonial. Artists sought to earn a living in this new environment that they have not mastered and for this, it is of course necessary to be pleasing to those who will buy the artwork, colon or the tourist (Tchibozo, 2003, 2014a and 2015a; Gnonhouevi, 2013).¹² Thus, gradually, will develop a purely functional production, the aim being to remind a tourist that he was travelling in another country (Tchibozo, *ibid*, 40). What seems important to point out here, is the process which leads African artists in general to change direction in the sculptural and pictorial production, and subsequently, to depend on a certain market which has led to the emergence of a certain art called, at a certain time, “airport art.”

In 1975, taking place in Frankfurt, Germany, a major exhibition on African art whose title, *Kunst? Handwerk in Afrika im Wandel* (Art? Arts and craft in Africa in change) showed what was the State of aesthetic practices on the continent. African sculpture which, a few years earlier won recognition with the European avant-garde artists is still in questioning to know if it is art and crafts? It was then particularly highlighted the case of Kenya where sculptors have even ended up losing the few of liberty that remained to them. They worked, mostly, in art and craft center or in these places, called in other countries, “art and crafts villages.”¹³ Their production should be therefore complying with standards dictated by the manager to ensure that the products are well sold. Any attempt to circumvent this kind of packaging is almost impossible. This is the case of this Kenyan sculptor called Joseph Mulli. He attempted to escape the routine of serial production imposed by a production center in Nairobi to introduce a little more creative in his work. For months or even years, his pieces were not sold, the market was controlled and it was almost demeaning compared the prices proposed to his works. In an article in the catalogue accompanying the exhibition in Frankfurt, Johanna Agathe, the Commissioner reported on the situation of artists in the field and therefore, in an interview given to Joseph Mulli, he stated: “... They offered me whenever some small prizes, but each time, I refused because I understood that they were trying to starve me...”¹⁴ There are here, the problem of freedom of creation which is binding upon the artist. Held by a system, the artist is almost forced to submit to his will. Colonial administrators, soldiers and missionaries appear in the production as well as highly Christianized sculptures, entirely new theme.

Thus for the sculpture, through this Kenyan example and in turn, the examples of several countries on the continent, we understand that it was almost not here transmission of techniques, but rather attempt to impoverishment of the know-how. If African sculpture

continued to exist in its original splendor and a modern extension, it is because of the resistance organized by artists like Joseph Mulli, Tokoudagba, or Akpan.

With regard to painting, the situation was any other. Despite the discoveries made during archaeological research everywhere on the continent proving the existence of wall paintings, so a pictorial tradition, Africa was seen by many Westerners as a continent where painting is a new, never practical kind of art.¹⁵ Then, it seemed necessary, for some of them, to initiate the Africans to this category through the techniques and rules “in force” in Europe. At this stage of the reflection, it appears useful to ask two questions. First, what are the techniques and rules exported to Africa? Then and more importantly, how have these rules been introduced on the continent?

As far as the first question, you might think that it is obvious insofar as, in the middle of 20th century, it is the time where the phenomenon had become palpable in Africa, there had already been many changes with regard to aesthetic practices in Europe. Artistic movements followed one another using violence or irony to break with the academicism (Tchibozo, 2014). However, for Africa, “children’s art,” these rules, from the point of view of the Europeans, seemed still essential to learn how to paint. This was a new civilizing vocation of primitive peoples who know nothing. Why was it so important to transfer the knowledge on the continent? An early response is in the first idea of workshops initiative in specific locations on the continent, so that there is not in Africa, independent artistic practice of any influence especially, European art and that the art produced on the continent will be a copy “Africanized” of European art and whether, in the words of Busca (2000, 151)¹⁶ “a place of confrontation between postcolonial Fundamentalism, wild Expressionism and peaceful naivety.”¹⁷

As to the question on how the rules have been introduced on the continent, I could talk about adoption of subtle strategies still difficult to be seriously studied today, but also by successive touches because occupations were held at different times. We could even imagine that it had been skillfully orchestrated. The introduction was thus made on the continent by “willingness” totally independent or taking advantage of their lost time as a colonial official. Examples in East Africa with Margaret Trowell, in Central Africa, the two Congo’s with Pierre Lods and Pierre-Romain Desfossés and in West Africa, in Nigeria and Senegal with Georgia and Uli Beier when they were still married and once again, P. Lods. I won’t redo the detail of history, but you should know that, at anytime and anywhere, except South Africa for white populations and later, in East Africa with Margaret Trowell, there had not been formal schools to learn the profession.

The strategy was the establishment of workshops which, of course, have had varying fortunes. The archaic techniques of modernism were distilled into the heads from the instructions of connoisseurs, catalogues of exhibitions, but also works of painting of “fine arts.” It is in these conditions that the early works of painting of African artists were appeared and elsewhere, promoted in Europe by these same actors who were at the base. This will later inspire to Busca (2000, 149) this:

Since the 30 years however, a number of colonists is going to be moved of the existence of this untapped breeding ground of African talents, to induce and to control the emergence of a new artistic activity that will lead to the birth of African international art [...] Some Europeans are going to settle therefore in mentors, to use themselves to lavish their advice and to provide the materials, to discipline, to create the workshops and schools that sometimes will evolve in schools of Fine arts. Very devoted, these discoverers buy some pieces, make some orders, make know the work of their protégés.¹⁸

This reflection reveals the whole complexity of the artistic and cultural relations between Africa and Europe. Here, Busca underlines the will of the European to master the African artistic creation while instructing the artists to produce in a sense to be conform to the taste of the moment and therefore, to the art market. If they had not been encouraged to work in this kind of style, how that would be possible and especially, how these artists would be present in exhibitions in Paris. Why was it necessary to recall here that the mentors have made these artists disciplined? In another reflection in the same book at the page 151, quoted below, she wrote about “knowledge.” What knowledge it is really here about? Is the knowledge of the evolution of the aesthetic practices in Europe? Or is the knowledge of the rules of practice of painting about?

This brings me to evoke two concrete cases of transmission of the techniques in Africa that succeeded to the opening out of informal “schools,” since never internationally recognized and which here, allow me to illustrate my thoughts.

First, the Poto-Poto “school” created by Pierre Lods who arrived in the Congo in 1948 as a soldier in the French army. Some years later, after having gotten on vacation of the army, he initiated in 1951 the establishment of school with a particular vision to make it, “Center for African Art,” in other words, a center of excellence and reference of the African painting. But, whom speak about center of excellence, inevitably induce requirements. What kinds of requirements were those of Lods? No serious study

over the period of the operation in the school has never spoken about. It could be then only, until some ulterior studies deepen the question and confirm it to us, that the requirements are related to the respect of the techniques and the rules in force in the schools of "Fine arts" in France and in Europe. It is very important to recall that he was a soldier and therefore, formed to the rigorism. Consequently, it is certainly the first who teach artists the unbending observance of the rules of which spoke Busca (2000, 151).¹⁹ The evidence, sometime after, he was invited by Senghor to found the school of Dakar, Poto-poto artists have found their own way by inventing the style today called "Mikeys" which would mean in the Congolese language, "child" since surprised, observers asked artists what they were doing and they responded, "children."

The second experience on the continent which it is useful to talk about here is the Osogbo school. Why is Osogbo where the school has prospered and not elsewhere on the Nigerian territory? The same question had preoccupied Ulli Bier (1991) who was put it itself in these terms:

Why did this cultural explosion happen in Oshogbo, and not in Ede or Ilesha or Oyo? This question has often been asked and is, of course, unanswerable. It is worth asking, however, because it may help us define the special magic of this Yoruba kingdom that distinguished it from other such city states.²⁰

It is true that Ede, Ilesha or Oyo had great artistic destinies in comparison with Osogbo insofar, Beier argument cannot satisfy me and can bring us closer of what thought Lods by creating Poto-poto school in Brazzaville, create a center that stands out from all others. It is necessary to notice that Oshogbo school is not the only contemporary artistic movement in Nigeria, but there are also Nsukka and the Zaria rebels school. However, it has value of symbol by the history of its formation. Founded 400 years ago, the city of Oshogbo, by a conflicting conjuncture nourished by the Fulani intrusions that disturbed the peace in the region and to which the emigrated Yoruba's put end had become this people's pride. But during the years 1950, the political complications exacerbated by the religious crises are going to severely undermine the reputation of the consecrated forest of Oshogbo. The customary responsibilities and the sanctions fell in a deep lethargy and the sanctuaries, almost abandoned to the depredations, nourished the antiquity market. It was at the moment of decadence of the religious customs and especially, of enormous loss of the artistic heritage that occurred in the history of this city, the arrival of Ulli Beier and Suzanne Wenger. Suzanne Wenger initiated then, with the king's support, the "New sacred Art" for, among others, to achieve big sculptures on

behalf of the small portable that disappeared. She participates in the protection of the sanctuaries from robberies, to the spiritual densification and so, to give back to the sacred forest its image of yesteryear. Obviously, these pieces changed the situation of the forest that had become again a symbol of the identity for the whole Yoruba people that didn't hesitate anymore to go there in pilgrimage. This is how we could paint the legendary history of a city very close to the decadence and that recovered its splendor with a new artistic production. However, in the facts, how and to what moment did take place the transmissions of techniques?

The history of the transmission of the techniques of aesthetic practices has started at Osogbo with the organization of the first workshop in 1961. In his book devoted to this experience in Osogbo, Ulli Beier (1991) wrote this:

When the West Indian artist Denis Williams and the black American painter Jacob Lawrence came to conduct five-day workshops in 1962 and 1963 the young actors went into it without preconceived ideas and with complete freedom. It was not until Georgina Beier settled in Oshogbo in 1963 that the artistic activity acquired a professional basis. She set up studios and provided materials in which a group of artists could work intensely for the next few years. Being only a few years older, it was easy for her to adopt the role of a colleague rather than a teacher.²¹

Therefore, from this time we noticed that the first transmissions took place and the artists, despite this concept of freedom that Ulli Beier wants to put forward here, were supported seriously and especially, with Denis William's "teaching." Painter, novelist and art historian who came from Guyana, described by Beier itself as "The Catalysers" he was invited in 1962 to collaborate with the architect Julian Beinart instructor of the first workshop of 1961 and the Portuguese Mozambican architect Amencio Guedes. In 1963, Denis Williams was joined by the famous Afro-American artist Jacob Lawrence and Ghanaian artist Vincent Kofi who came to launch the exhibition of his sculptures. It was a same thing with Georgina Beier including the "teaching" from 1963 which would have transformed the young artists in true professionals in the own words of Beier (1991). Finally, in 1974, Beier decided to invite Ru van Rossem, a Dutch painter whom he met in London at the opening of his exhibition at one of the last workshops in Osogbo. In only three weeks of training, his influence was monumental wrote Beier (1991). In an article written for the book of Beier, Ru van Rossem described himself how he transmitted techniques to Oshogbo artists:

My problem was how to manage to transmit the method I want to use. Ulli Beier gave me some sound advice. He told me, don't give them themes to work on, tell them: "Do what you want to make"—and then you will see that the ideas start flowing. This was indeed the case.²²

As we can notice, the sources of transmission of techniques were many and to prove it, Beir (1991) added this, to show that they have really undergone a metamorphosis in terms of production management:

The instructors employed a kind of shock tactics, to free people from conventions and inhibitions, clear the debris of stale instruction from their mind and help them to dissociate artistic form from conventional contexts and help them toward a fresh, personal vision.²³

It is therefore undoubtedly to arise the question of the status of artists, but also the one of their production in terms of positioning. This question is particularly paroxysmal after the following workshops requiring Beier (1991) to seek to resolve it in his book when he wrote this:

These young artists had no problems of identity; it never occurred to them once, to try and define whether their work was "Yoruba" or "African" or "Western." They worked in a kind of euphoria... Painting was for them a way of discovering their potential, of developing a new outlook on life.²⁴

As the problem is posed and the attempt of a posture defense shows any embarrassment that it generates. Therefore, we could rightly wonder what purpose were for these informal training and especially how artists from the continent have reacts on it?

Impacts on aesthetic practices

This part of the paper will show how African artists have responded to this situation. In other words, how have they adopted these techniques? The studied cases in the previous section will serve me here before that I convene other reactions on the continent (Fig. 2).

Concerning Poto-poto, the reaction of the artists was late and following the departure of Pierre Lods to Dakar where he went to found the school of the city of the same name. The artists developed the style called "Mikeys" which was mainly launched by Félix Ossali, one of the pioneers of the school. What could refer this new creative direction? These paintings are small human forms dancing or being in daily activities, which lead to give the name "child." This production reminds curiously rock art discovered by archaeological excavations on the continent, particular



Fig. 2 Zountegni Philippe Alias ZOUNT. *A l'Autel des aieules (To the Altar of the Forebear)*, 2015. Sculpture de sculpture of forged Iron and raffia, Sculpture/Assemblage, 230 cm x 67 cm x 62 cm, private collection in Benin. Photograph Romuald Tchibozo

in Tassili in Algeria, in Tanzania, in Namibia and in South Africa. The animation of the contemporary political life of South Africa makes us review this image through the members of the party of Julius Malema who dress like children to oppose to President Zuma. You can imagine that, in the context of creation of these works, the allusion might be ironic or even political. It should be noted that it was a sensitive time for populations where ruled the hard labor and where repression-imposed deprivation of freedoms of speech. Result, it appears almost naturally here the veiled rebirth of pictorial traditions at the heart of Africa which, obviously, doesn't put everyone agree. This had raised a controversy in Europe who dealt with



Fig. 3 Grégoire Marie Noudehou, *Route of Slaves or My Tears of Blood*, 2015. Installation, 300 cm x 300 cm x 288 cm, private collection, Cotonou (Bénin). Photograph Romuald Tchibozo

this decadent production. This no longer corresponded to the basic instructions transmitted to the artists by Lods, for example, as the rules and the technical composition of the works seemed missing. The period of appearance of this new form was precisely marked by the departure of Pierre Lods from the direction of the school. This led Busca (2000) wrote that: “The most common conception of the African contemporary art calls the problematic of the identity, not the one of the art...”²⁵ (Fig. 3)

Oshogbo artists have had the merit to have a deep root, before Beier’s intervention and the one of all those who have accompanied them in the various workshops, in a particularly strong culture. Unusually, they have used all possible media to deploy their creation. Creations also demonstrated a progression or rather the passage of a strict academicism to a freedom from the rules. The pioneers from Bisi Fabunmi, Asiru Olatunde to Muraina Oyelami one of the last passing through the generation of the Tween Seven, metal, cement, batik and painting have been explored to express Yoruba culture.

The birth of these schools has also emulated on the continent. It was born, for example, “Vohou-vohou” in Abidjan in Côte d’Ivoire. This case was also a takeover by artists after the transmission of techniques by Serge Hélénon, a Martinican from “Caribbean Negro school” who taught the “fine art” in Abidjan. The specialty of this movement is the painting on tapa, a kind of cloth

made from timber trees or beaten tree bark. In addition to this, these artists added or sticking all the elements that fell them under the hand, used from natural colors of clays, powders of dried plants, and assembled them on chassis obtained very quickly from wood.

Finally, I can also mention here the case of the Tingatinga art. Born in Tanzania with Edward Saïd Tingatinga, the movement radiates happily even after his death and is characterized by the use of bright colors. Unlike other movements, it did not object of transmission of techniques inherited from the “fine arts,” but rather by an oral process that the techniques are passed to the disciples. It is almost a unique contemporary practice case on the continent.

Conclusion

At the end of this reflection on the process of transmission and adoption of the techniques of European art in Africa, it should be noted that the forms taken by these operations are diverse according to the changing circumstances that characterize them, even if the basic ideas seem to meet up. Traditional centers of intense art production on the continent at the pre-colonial period was invested by initiatives which are still poorly elucidated today especially, the one that will allow to more understand the pursued objectives. For the process of disorientation, African artists have brought answers of varying fortunes. This led to some criticism and comments in the European

artistic literature that called this rebellious production of decadent. Decadent compared to what? That is the question that we might be tempted to ask. Furthermore, art movements born as a result of these initiatives have never relied on the international chessboard, and

today, it is more and more concern about the reasons for this international ostracism of the list of artistic movements. This raises the question firstly of the place of African modern art and then, the one of the contemporary arts in the international concert.

NOTES

- 1 See for more information Tchibozo Romuald, "L'art africain face au défi de la mondialisation," in Mouckaga H., Dianzinga S. et Owaye J-F. (dir.), *Ethnies, Nations, Développement en Afrique*, Actes du colloque de Brazzaville (Congo) du 26 au 28 mai 2014 (Paris: L'Harmattan, 2015), 629–652 and Gnonhouevi David, *La sculpture sur bois en pays Agonlin: de 1858 à 2011 (des objets traditionnels au masque Guèlèdè)* (Mémoire de maîtrise, Université d'Abomey-Calavi, 2013).
- 2 Several books on this mission, but also about the brought back pieces have been published in various occasions by the authors of the mission of which Marcel Griaule, Michel Leiris, Denise Paulme et al.
- 3 Dupuis Anne, "À propos de souvenirs inédits de Denise Paulme et Michel Leiris, sur la création du musée de l'homme en 1936," *Cahiers d'études africaines*, vol. 39, n. 155–156 (Prélever, exhiber, La mise en musées, 1999), 511–538.
- 4 Jean Laude, *La peinture Française (1905–1914) et "l'art Nègre"* (Paris: Klincksieck, 1968).
- 5 During this period, World fairs were organized in France, Great Britain, Belgium and Holland to show on the one hand, the power of these countries by the expansion in all these colonies and on the other hand, to show the weak level of development of the colonized countries of which even people was treated like zoo animals to justify the civilizing mission at the origin of the colonization. Specific art exhibitions as the one of The Art in Congo during the World fair and the one International of Brussels (1958) were also organized.
- 6 Ferrier Jean-Louis, *La lecture des œuvres picturales* (Encyclopædia Universalis en ligne consulté le 28 janvier 2013).
- 7 André Malraux, *Le musée imaginaire* (Paris: Gallimard Collection Folio, 1996).
- 8 Brazilian researchers, with the participation of other eminent researchers coming from all over the world, have just published their version of the understanding of this work in 2015 in Rio de Janeiro. Not very long ago, in 2011 a review *Gradhiva*, the number 14, was entirely dedicated to this publication with various points of view and especially the article, "Carl Einstein and the Primitivism."
- 9 Frans Olbrechts, *Les Arts plastiques du Congo belge* (Bruxelles: Érasme, 1959).
- 10 See for this Rubin Williams, *"Primitivism" in 20th Century Art: Affinity of the Tribal and the Modern* (Paris, Flammarion, 1984).
- 11 The majority of the kings on the throne during the wars of colonization was killed and, those of them that survived, were ostracized at the end of the fights. It was the case of King Béhanzin of Danxomé at present Republic of Benin who was deported in Martinique before coming to die in Blida in Algeria.
- 12 Tchibozo Romuald, *L'art contemporain d'Afrique et la guerre froide: le cas Allemand* (Allemagne: Ed. PAF, Saarbrücken, 2014a). Tchibozo Romuald, "L'art africain face au défi de la mondialisation," in Mouckaga H., Dianzinga S. et Owaye J-F. (dir.), *Ethnies, Nations, Développement en Afrique*, Actes du colloque de Brazzaville (Congo), du 26 au 28 mai 2014 (Paris: L'Harmattan, 2015a), 629–652. David Gnonhouevi, *La sculpture sur bois en pays Agonlin: de 1858 à 2011 (des objets traditionnels au masque Guèlèdè)* (Mémoire de maîtrise, Université d'Abomey-Calavi, 2013).
- 13 The Kenyas' case is valid in a lot of other African countries. Most African governments started creating these centers to regroup and to control the craftsmen. The difference in Kenya is that the initiative to put this organization in place is private, the management of the same structures in the other countries, for example in Benin, is rather public.
- 14 See for this Agathe Johanna, *Kunst? Handwerk in Afrika im Wandel* (Frankfurt/M, 1975), 96.
- 15 See for more information, *Histoire Générale de l'Afrique T I*.
- 16 Joëlle Busca, *L'art contemporain Africain, Du colonialisme au postcolonialisme, collection les arts d'ailleurs* (Paris: L'Harmattan, 2000).
- 17 Joëlle Busca, op. cit., 151.
- 18 Ibid., 149.
- 19 Joëlle Busca, 151 wrote this: "Without knowledge or inhibition, African artists approach painting with both high rigidities in compliance with formal obsolete rules and a lack of stylistic constraints oscillating between a semi-abstract, a poor imitation of the school of Paris and identity research that strives to fix on canvas the representation of traditional cultures in the form of genre scene still the same."
- 20 Ulli Bier, *Thirty Years of Oshogbo Art* (Bayreuth: Iwalewa Haus, 1991), 3.
- 21 Ibid., 6.
- 22 Ibid., 72.
- 23 Ibid., 63.
- 24 Ibid., 6.
- 25 Joëlle Busca, op. cit., 167.

学术顾问：朱青生

项目统筹：吴 宁 鲍静静

编辑统筹：施帼玮 李彦岑

责任编辑：施帼玮 吴 萌 朱 健 蒋珊珊

特约编辑：胡 桥

特约审校：燕 阳

Academic Advisor: Laozhu

Project Coordinators: Wu Ning / Bao Jingjing

Editorial Coordinators: Shi Guowei / Li Yancen

Editors: Shi Guowei / Wu Meng / Zhu Jian / Jiang Shanshan

Contributing Editor: Hu Qiao

Contributing Reviser: Yan Yang

ISBN 978-7-100-17720-7



定价：1680.00元（全三卷）